**Sinclair Community College**

**Continuous Improvement Annual Update 2012-13**

**Please submit to your dean and the Provost’s Office no later than Oct. 1, 2012**

**Department:** 0679 – Health Information Management

Year of Last Program Review: FY 2006-2007

Year of Next Program Review: FY 2013-2014

**Section I: Department Trend Data, Interpretation, and Analysis**

**Degree and Certificate Completion Trend Data – OVERALL SUMMARY**

Please provide an interpretation and analysis of the Degree and Certificate Completion Trend Data (Raw Data is located in Appendix A*): i.e. What trends do you see in the above data? Are there internal or external factors that account for these trends? What are the implications for the department? What actions have the department taken that have influenced these trends? What strategies will the department implement as a result of this data?*

Prior to Fall Quarter 2009, students were required to apply for "graduation" from the certificate programs. After Fall 2009, an automated system for certificate completion was implemented and resulted in a 54% increase in the issuance of certificates (Medical Coding and Billing Specialist and Medical Office Coding Specialist) awarded.

Beginning in Fall 2008, there were changes made to the HIM curriculum to include a BIO 121 program prerequisite. The changes may have contributed to the measure of student success rates for completion of the HIM AAS degree.

Starting in Fall 2008, the entire HIM Associate Degree curriculum was available wholly online. Students generally living outside of the Dayton area are admitted into the remote cohort which is a growing population as this cohort has continued to increase in number starting with 2010 graduates.

Externally, socioeconomic reasons (such as layoffs in manufacturing and business relocations) increased the number of students enrolled in HIM courses as displaced students seemed to be searching for a healthcare field program with little to no wait list.

Implications of the HIM program growth have resulted in the need for additional skilled faculty, increased course offerings (different times, more sections, online sections), and a need for remote cohort Professional Practice Experience/clinical (PPE) coordination. Strategies that the department continues to implement as a result of this explosive growth and in order promote student success include: 1) continual mentoring of new faculty (full-time and adjunct), 2) increasing the skill mix of faculty members (including online course coordination skills) needed to support student success, and 3) encouraging training for technical/ANGEL expertise for all faculty members.

**Course Success Trend Data – OVERALL SUMMARY**

Please provide an interpretation and analysis of the Course Success Trend Data (Raw Data is located in Appendix A). Looking at the success rate data provided in the Appendix for each course, please discuss trends for high enrollment courses, courses used extensively by other departments, and courses where there have been substantial changes in success.

In 2008, the HIM 121 and HIM 122 courses were transformed as a result of the requirements of a Learning Challenge Grant. HIM121 and HIM122 were standardized with the course content. A new textbook and instructor presentation tools were provided. Effective AY2008, this course was offered online (for the first time) and face-to-face. For AY2007 and AY2008, the success rate for HIM121 was 69.4% and in AY2011-2012 the success rate increased to 78.5%. This is a result of the transformed course. HIM122 went from 81.7% to 84.9%. (Note: The 84.9% excludes the data for Spring AY2011-2012 which is not available).

Student success in the coding courses (HIM260, HIM261, and HIM262) continually raises a red flag when comparing student success between online and on-campus courses (see Attachment A - Comparison grid) This comparison has been concurrently monitored throughout the past few years. The coding courses have been revised and learning resources have been changed. The coding course now requires a prerequisite of a higher-level biology. In addition to the changes made within the coding course material, the department has created a coding concepts course (starting Fall 2012) for BIS medical-option students. These BIS students were a large component of these coding courses. These BIS students' curriculum had required HIM260 and HIM261, however, with the advent of the semester curriculum, BIS students are no longer required to take courses with such intensive coding skills. The effects of these changes should show in the Fall 2012 course comparisons. Measurement and assessment is continuing.

The HIM240 course went from a 100.0% student success rate in AY2007-2008 to 88.6% in AY2010-2011. Concurrent analysis resulted in findings that the textbook was a huge factor in the decline in student success rate. The textbook was found to contain inadequate content for intended student outcomes and low-level coding scenarios. The course was revised which included expanded online content, increased skill-level coding scenarios, and online resources promote student engagement. Student success in this course is ongoing.

Please provide any additional data and analysis that illustrates what is going on in the department (examples might include accreditation data, program data, benchmark data from national exams, course sequence completion, retention, demographic data, data on placement of graduates, graduate survey data, etc.)

-Accredition data - The HIM program has maintained continual full accreditation with American Health Information Management Association.

-Program data - Current analysis is beginning to compare student success of students who take HIM courses online vs. on-campus. Results are not yet available.

-Benchmark data from national exam - RHIT exam results demonstrated 100% (16 out of 16) of our students passed (based on last AHIMA School Score Report). Also, compared to the national mean, Sinclair’s results were above the national mean in 100% of AHIMA’s subdomains

-Retention - The attrition rate for 10-11 academic year (as reported in AHIMA's Annual Program Report) was 15.6 %.

-Demographic data - In addition to the students who live in Ohio yet outside the Dayton area, our current HIM cohort students span to include 5 additional states to include Kentucky, Washington, Texas, Pennsylvania and California.

-Data of placement of graduates - Of our June 2011 graduates, 80% are either employed in an -HIM-related position or continuing their education.

-Graduate survey data - Each year our program is required by our accrediting agency to distribute to past graduates a student satisfaction rate. As reported in the most recent AHIMA Annual Program Report, our employer satisfaction rate was 100%.

-Employer satisfaction rate - Each year our program is required by our accrediting agency to distribute an Employer Statisfaction survey. As reported in the most recent AHIMA Annual Program Report, our employer satisfaction rate was 100%.

**Section II: Progress Since the Most Recent Review**

Below are the goals from Section IV part E of your last Program Review Self-Study. Describe progress or changes made toward meeting each goal over the last year.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **GOALS** | **Status** | **Progress or Rationale for No Longer Applicable** |
| We have proposed an entirely web-based cohort of the HIM associate degree program. Our program has traditionally needed to restrict enrollment to 25 students per year due to the number of professional practice sites available in the Dayton area hospitals. | In progress  Completed  No longer applicable | The HIM program has successfully converted all 22 curriculum courses to an online format. The HIM program has two separate cohorts - local cohort and the remote cohort. The local cohort, due to limited number of available clinical sites, is limited to 35 students. The remote cohort is currently unlimited due to available remote clinical sites. For 2012, the total of both cohorts is starting with 59 students. |
| There are presently nine courses in the Medical Office Coding Certificate and all but one are available online. BIO 107 is the only course remaining that prevents us from marketing this certificate as available entirely online. If this obstacle is overcome, there might be significant opportunity for an increase in enrollment with some targeted marketing. | In progress  Completed  No longer applicable | Biology 107 (and its semester equivalent) is available online. However, the biology credit required in the Certificate is now the BIO 121 & BIO 122 equivalent and these BIO courses are available online. |
| As a result of the data reviewed during the self-study, we became more aware of the undesirable (although not unexpected) success rate in HIM 121 (63% for the last 3 years). This a top 45 enrollment course with almost 900 students enrolled last year. One of our goals for the coming year is to look at this course and examine our learning activities to determine if any changes could be made to improve student success. | In progress  Completed  No longer applicable | The HIM 121 and HIM 122 courses were transformed as a result of the requirements of a Learning Challenge Grant in 2008. HIM121 and HIM122 were standardized with the course content. A new textbook and instructor presentation tools were provided. Effective AY2008, this course was offered online (for the first time) and face-to-face. For AY2007 and AY2008, the success rate for HIM121 was 69.4% and in AY2011-2012 the success rate increased to 78.5%. This is a result of the transformed course. HIM122 went from 81.7% to 84.9%. (Note: The 84.9% excludes the data for Spring AY2011-2012 which is not available). |
| As part of our curriculum revision effective in Fall 2006, we implemented a mid-curriculum capstone course (HIM 178) in the summer between the first-year and second-year course work. The goal of this course is to be a summative assessment of first-year knowledge and skills and to reinforce the first-year course material with projects and assignments. This course will be offered for the first time during Summer 2007 and we will assess its success at three points: 1) at the end of the HIM 178 course, 2) during the second year of the curriculum, and 3) on the credentialing exam after graduation. | In progress  Completed  No longer applicable | Due to semester conversion, the HIM 178 course no longer exists. |

Below are the Recommendations for Action made by the review team. Describe the progress or changes made toward meeting each recommendation over the last year.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **RECOMMENDATIONS** | **Status** | **Progress or Rationale for No Longer Applicable** |
| In keeping with the department’s report that the current level of graduates largely meets local employment demand, it is recommended that the department continue to closely monitor the balance of graduates and job opportunities. Important factors influencing the demand of the program will include turnover in the profession, new coding standards and competition from other providers. The department is encouraged to gather and assess data where available regarding anticipated demand for the program. | In progress  Completed  No longer applicable | Data of placement of graduates - Of our June 2011 graduates, 80% are either employed in an -HIM-related position or continuing their education.  With the federal government's planned October 1, 2014 conversion to the new ICD-10-CM coding system, demand for our graduates is anticpated to remain strong. |
| The department is encouraged to articulate the SCC program with the baccalaureate degree completion program at the University of Cincinnati and other institutions. | In progress  Completed  No longer applicable | Articulation agreement was completed in August 2010. This agreement will be updated with semesters. |
| Assess the feasibility of offering Sinclair’s program fully online in order to enable more students to complete the program while meeting work and family commitments. An online program at Sinclair can prepare students to successfully complete UC’s baccalaureate degree completion program, which is offered fully online. It appears that the department and college have a relatively small window of opportunity for making the decision on whether or not to develop this online program, and prompt attention to this issue is warranted. | In progress  Completed  No longer applicable | As of Fall 2008, the Sinclair's HIM curriculum is offered fully online. |
| In anticipation of retirements among the faculty, develop a succession plan to ensure continuing strong leadership for the department. | In progress  Completed  No longer applicable | All planned retirements have already occurred, and the succession plan for the Chairperson and accompanying faculty positions was fulfilled. |
| Position the department to respond to education and training needs for the migration to I-10, a new coding standard, when it is approved by the Federal government. Plan to deliver this training through schedules and formats that are convenient for working professionals and consistent with the needs of employers. | In progress  Completed  No longer applicable | Faculty have completed Train the Trainer education, in-house training occurred with other full-time faculty, and a transition to I-10 course was developed. The delivery plan for I-10 has been created and is scheduled. Workforce Development has a plan to implement training within the community. |
| Investigate how students who have studied at proprietary institutions and now wish to enter Sinclair’s program might best be served. Consider alternatives such as prior learning assessment and proficiency exams as avenues for these students to demonstrate mastery of selected competencies. | In progress  Completed  No longer applicable | Prior learning assessment continues to be developed, especially within the Professional Practice Experience/clinical and proficiency exams have been created and are available for every HIM course. |
| Encourage all graduates of the program to take the national certification exam promptly upon graduation in order to increase the likelihood of success on the exam. | In progress  Completed  No longer applicable | The message of taking the national RHIT exam "as soon as possible after graduation" is reinforced to cohort students continually as they complete the HIM program. Additionally, now that students are permitted to take the RHIT exam within their last term of the program, students receive "incentive" in the capstone course to take the RHIT exam before graduation. Incentive is also provided via the HIM faculty nominating one student for the Ohio Health Information Management Association (OHIMA) Outstanding Student award which provides payment for the RHIT exam for the student. Miami Valley Health Information Management Association (MVHIMA) also pays for the student liaison's RHITexam. |
| Monitor impact of the program’s new prerequisites on student enrollment, progression and success. | In progress  Completed  No longer applicable | In comparing the success rate of advanced coding courses, it appears the additional higher-level biology course did not positively impact the student success rate of HIM 240 and HIM 241. However, with the impending converstion to the new ICD-10 coding system, the higher-level BIO is required due to the coding system's intense use of anatomy and physiology knowledge. |
| Consider alternative admission practices in order to enable students to begin the program at multiple points in the year. Such practice holds promise for filling slots created by attrition and thus increasing response time for students on wait lists and being more cost-effective. | In progress  Completed  No longer applicable | The remote cohort, due to the availability of PPE sites outside of the Dayton area, is the fertile ground in which staggered admission points could be implemented. The HIM department decided to wait until after the semester PPE term (Spring 2013) to analyze the opportunity of multiple points of entry into the remote cohort. |

**Section III: Assessment of General Education & Degree Program Outcomes**

The Program Outcomes for the degrees are listed below. **All program outcomes must be assessed at least once during the 5 year Program Review cycle, and assessment of program outcomes must occur each year**.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **General Education Outcomes** | To which degree(s) is this program outcome related? | Year assessed or to be assessed. | Assessment Methods  Used | What were the assessment results?  (Please provide brief summary data) |
| Oral Communication | | All programs | **2011-2012** | HIM278 - A grading rubric was used to assess the audio/video recording of a job interview; HIM278 and HIM246 - grading rubric was used to assess narrated PowerPoint presentations; HIM250, 251, 252 - site supervisors (community HIM professionals) gave feedback for the student's oral interaction during PPE/clinical. | Students in HIM278 were successful at audio recording and videotaping a simulated job interview. Student feedback proved this simulation a very enlightening and valuable experience.  Results of using a grading rubric with the narrated PowerPoints in HIM278 and HIM246 provided students with guidance in developing their audio portion of their presentation. Student feedback was positive concerning the narrated PPT assignment.  In HIM250, 251, and 252, students were evaluated by their site supervisors which are HIM professionals within the medical facility that the student is involved. The students respected the opinion of their site supervisor and "took to heart" the judgment of an experienced HIM professional. |
| Written Communication | | All programs | **2011-2012** | Five different discussion forums were included in HIM 297. These discussions were focused on students writing their review and including their opinion of a coding subject.  HIM250, 251, 252 required input from site supervisors for written assignments.  HIM245 included a grading rubric for a SWOT analysis. | HIM297 - These brand new discussion forums proved successful in encouraging students to form an individual opinion on a subject and posting their opinion prior to viewing their peers' opinion. Students also successfully responded to the opinions of their classmates.  Written assignments/reports in PPE (HIM250, 251, 252) provided a "real world" experience for students to receive feedback on written assignments from an HIM professional.  The grading rubric in the SWOT analysis proved successful in that students were able to focus on the specific analysis points required for a complete analysis. |
| Critical Thinking/Problem Solving | | All programs | **2012-2013** |  |  |
| Values/Citizenship/Community | | All programs | **2013-2014** |  |  |
| Computer Literacy | | All programs | **2014-2015** |  |  |
| Information Literacy | | All programs | **2015-2016** |  |  |
|  | |  |  |  |  |
| **Program Outcomes** | | To which course(s) is this program outcome related? | Year assessed or to be assessed. | Assessment Methods  Used | What were the assessment results?  (Please provide brief summary data) |
| Demonstrate the ability to design, organize and implement changes in the evolution of health information to electronic formats. | | HIM 1110, HIM 2214,  HIM 2106, HIM 2216,  HIM 2218, HIM 2120  BIS 1120, BIS 1121,  HIM 1204 |  |  |  |
| Evaluate and appropriately apply principles of confidentiality and privacy congruent with the standards and ethics of the health information profession. | | HIM 1110, HIM 1116,  HIM 1204, HIM 2214,  HIM 2218, BIS 1120,  ENG 1101, COM 2206/2111 | 2012-13 | Plan to use discussion forums, grading rubrics, and quizzes to assess student competencies covering privacy, confidentiality and ethics | We will be evaluating this in the upcoming year. |
| Apply effective skills in the areas of written and oral communication, critical thinking and problem solving in the practice of health information management. | | COM 2206/2111, ENG 1101,  MAT 1130/1110, PSY 1100 or SOC 1101, BIS 1121, HUM  HIM 1110, HIM 1204,  HIM 2110, HIM 2211,  HIM 2114, HIM 2120,  HIM 2106, HIM 2214,  HIM 2216, HIM 2218 | 2012-13 | Critical thinking coding skills will be assessed with quizzes and exams. With semester conversion, our coding courses were drastically transformed to include "real world" scenarios and health records. | We will be evaluating this in the upcoming year. |
| Demonstrate proficiency in classifications and nomenclatures sufficient to support reimbursement in multiple patient care environments. | | BIO 1121, BIO 1222,  ALH 1140, HIM 1101,  HIM 1110, HIM 1115,  HIM 1201, HIM 1217,  HIM 2110, HIM 2211,  HIM 2114, HIM 2120  HIM 2216, HIM 2218 |  |  |  |
| Demonstrate competency and skill in the technology used by the healthcare information environment. | | BIS 1120, BIS 1121,  HIM 1110, HIM 1201,  HIM 1217, HIM 2120,  HIM 2106, HIM 2214,  HIM 2216, HIM 2218,  HIM 1204, HIM 2110,  HIM 2211 |  |  |  |
| Demonstrate the ability to perform the health information associate degree entry-level competencies as identified by the American Health Information Management Association. | | All courses in the HIM curriculum |  |  |  |
| Demonstrate personal behaviors, attitudes and values consistent with and appropriate to the entry-level health information management professional. | | All HIM courses in the HIM curriculum |  |  |  |

**General Education Outcomes**

1. Are changes planned as a result of the assessment of general education outcomes? If so, what are those changes?

Grading rubrics for discussion forums are being continually added in courses as these rubrics provide helpful guidelines for both the students and the instructors. Also, instructors must provide resources and instruction for students when assignments and activities require MLA intext citing and works cited.

1. How will you determine whether those changes had an impact?

Student feedback and grade comparison should determine the impact of these changes.

**Program Outcomes**

1. Are changes planned as a result of the assessment of program outcomes? If so, what are those changes?

We have determined that health record analysis (using Joint Commission standards) must be injected in early curriculum courses.

Faculty continue to investigate methods for including an electronic health record (EHR) in the HIM program. This is a very necessary addition for introducing students to the mechanics of an EHR and enhancing their skills for working in an EHR .

1. How will you determine whether those changes had an impact?

Health record analysis is assessed in the "real world" during the last semester of the HIM curriculum when students attend PPE.

Student feedback and subdomain scores from the RHIT exam will determine if the introduction of an EHR enhanced student skills and familiarity with this technology.

**Improvement Efforts**

1. What were the results of changes that were planned in the last Annual Update? Are further changes needed based on these results?

Our program planned to begin a health record repository which includes scanned versions of "real" medical records. Currently there are 17 scanned medical records in our repository and these records are being utilized in the HIM 1110, HIM 2110, HIM2252, and HIM2211. Faculty plan to continue to add records to this repository.

1. Are there any other improvement efforts that have not been discussed in this Annual Update submission?

Our faculty are committed to continued quality improvement with our newly-developed semester courses.

As an online program, faculty have realized the value of student engagement with audio feedback to students and the use of audio/video lessons and course material review via Adobe Connect. Faculty are beginning to embrace this technology and are implement ing this valuable "face-to-face" connection with online students.

**APPENDIX – PROGRAM COMPLETION AND SUCCESS RATE DATA**

**Degree and Certificate Completion**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Department | Department Name | Program | FY 07-08 | FY 08-09 | FY 09-10 | FY 10-11 |
| 0679 | Health Information Management | HCC.CRT | 1 | . | . | . |
| 0679 | Health Information Management | HIM.AAS | 19 | 15 | 33 | 24 |
| 0679 | Health Information Management | MCBS.STC | . | 9 | 115 | 126 |
| 0679 | Health Information Management | MOCS.STC | 81 | 62 | 17 | 3 |
| 0679 | Health Information Management | MOR.STC | . | 21 | 45 | 58 |
| 0679 | Health Information Management | MT.CRT | 5 | 1 | . | . |

**Course Success Rates**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Department | Department Name | Course | FY 07-08 | FY 08-09 | FY 09-10 | FY 10-11 | FY 11-12 (excludes Spring) |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-110 | 95.5% | 89.2% | 90.0% | 93.8% | 93.8% |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-111 | 90.9% | 96.8% | 94.4% | 97.6% | 93.6% |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-116 | . | . | . | . | . |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-118 | . | . | . | . | . |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-121 | 69.4% | 77.5% | 79.1% | 75.9% | 78.5% |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-122 | 81.7% | 87.4% | 89.2% | 85.4% | 84.9% |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-135 | 66.0% | 71.8% | 77.6% | 75.7% | 69.6% |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-165 | . | 97.4% | 94.6% | 91.0% | 90.7% |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-178 | 100.0% | 100.0% | 97.1% | 100.0% | 97.5% |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-202 | 50.0% | . | . | . | . |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-218 | . | . | 100.0% | 93.1% | . |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-220 | 90.9% | . | . | . | . |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-228 | 94.4% | 100.0% | 100.0% | 100.0% | 100.0% |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-240 | 100.0% | 97.0% | 83.9% | 88.6% | . |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-241 | 100.0% | 100.0% | 100.0% | 100.0% | 94.6% |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-244 | 93.8% | 100.0% | 96.6% | 100.0% | 91.4% |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-245 | 100.0% | . | 96.3% | 93.6% | 91.7% |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-246 | 94.1% | 100.0% | 100.0% | 96.2% | 100.0% |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-249 | 83.3% | 90.9% | 90.5% | 83.1% | 88.1% |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-250 | 94.1% | 93.8% | 96.9% | 100.0% | 94.6% |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-251 | 100.0% | 100.0% | 100.0% | 96.2% | 100.0% |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-252 | 100.0% | 100.0% | 100.0% | 100.0% | . |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-258 | 100.0% | 100.0% | . | . | . |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-260 | 71.2% | 69.0% | 74.9% | 63.9% | 59.6% |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-261 | 64.9% | 64.2% | 68.2% | 60.8% | 62.2% |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-262 | 65.3% | 64.5% | 74.1% | 56.9% | 58.7% |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-265 | 100.0% | 96.6% | 90.6% | 92.5% | . |
| 679 | Health Information Management | HIM-278 | 100.0% | 100.0% | 97.0% | 100.0% | . |

FY 2010-2011

FY 2011-2012

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Course | Term | Location | Success Rate |
| HIM 260 | 11/WI | Face-to-face | 74.07% |
|  |  | Online | 66.09% |
|  | 11/SP | Face-to-face | 71.83% |
|  |  | Online | 53.15% |
|  | 11/SU | Face-to-face | 86.96% |
|  |  | Online | 58.70% |
|  | 11/FA | Face-to-face | 72.55% |
|  |  | Online | 50.00% |
|  | 12/WI | Face-to-face | 66.67% |
|  |  | Online | 48.57% |
|  | 12/SP | Face-to-face | 58.33% |
|  |  | Online | 54.72% |
| HIM 261 | 11/WI | Face-to-face | 83.33% |
|  |  | Online | 53.33% |
|  | 11/SP | Face-to-face | 74.55% |
|  |  | Online | 47.92% |
|  | 11/SU | Face-to-face | 80.00% |
|  |  | Online | 50.00% |
|  | 11/FA | Face-to-face | 62.22% |
|  |  | Online | 55.56% |
|  | 12/WI | Face-to-face | 73.58% |
|  |  | Online | 63.89% |
|  | 12/SP | Face-to-face | 65.71% |
|  |  | Online | 45.00% |
| HIM 262 | 11/WI | Face-to-face | 86.96% |
|  |  | Online | 54.84% |
|  | 11/SP | Face-to-face | 92.86% |
|  |  | Online | 47.92% |
|  | 11/SU | Face-to-face | --- |
|  |  | Online | 40.63% |
|  | 11/FA | Face-to-face | 81.25% |
|  |  | Online | 50.00% |
|  | 12/WI | Face-to-face | 88.24% |
|  |  | Online | 48.48% |
|  | 12/SP | Face-to-face | 69.23% |
|  |  | Online | 58.62% |

**Attachment A – Comparison Grid**